

ALL-VOLUME OVERVIEWi

**CHAPTER 5
Satellite Launches in the PRC: Hughes**

CHAPTER SUMMARY 2

**OPTUS B2, APSTAR 2 LAUNCH FAILURES: PRC GAINS
SENSITIVE KNOWLEDGE FROM HUGHES INVESTIGATIONS 6**

**THE PROHIBITION AGAINST TECHNOLOGY TRANSFER
IN FOREIGN LAUNCHES 8**
International Traffic in Arms Regulations and the U.S. Munitions List 8
Department of Defense Monitoring Role 9

OPTUS B2 10
The Optus B2 Licenses 10
The Optus B2 Fails To Achieve Orbit 12
Failure Investigation Teams 14
Failure Investigation Begins 14
Hughes’ Export Administrators Deal with the Licensing Question 17
A ‘Political’ Business Solution 21
The Optus B3: Hughes’ Efforts to Improve the Long March Continue 36

APSTAR 2 40
The Apstar 2 License 40
The Apstar 2 Failure 40
Failure Investigation Teams 42
Failure Investigation Schedule 42
The Need for a License 42
Commerce Department Conference 46
Same Fairing Failure Identified by Hughes 47
A ‘Political’ Business Solution, Again? 48
The Commerce Department Approves Data Release to the PRC 50



Hughes Tries to Get the PRC to Accept Its Findings	51
CIA Analyst Visits Hughes	56
A ‘Consolidated Solution’	58
Final Failure Investigation Report Released to the PRC by the Commerce Department ...	60
Implementing the ‘Consolidated Solution’	64
U.S. Government Actions Following the Apstar 2 Launch Failure	66
Defense Department Assessments of Damage to National Security	68
<i>Damage to National Security from the Apstar 2 Failure Investigation</i>	69
<i>Damage to National Security from the Sharing of Coupled Loads Analysis</i>	72
<i>Damage to National Security from Providing the PRC with</i> <i>Information Concerning Deficiencies in the Fairing, and</i> <i>Resultant Improvements to PRC Rockets and Ballistic Missiles</i>	73
<i>Other Information Learned by the PRC, and Defense Department Reaction</i>	74
State Department Assessments of Damage to National Security	75
Damage to National Security Identified by the Select Committee’s Technical Consultant	85
CHARLIE TRIE, THE PRC, AND HUGHES ELECTRONICS	87
FURTHER INVESTIGATION WARRANTED	88
TECHNICAL AFTERWORD: Nose Fairings on Rockets and Ballistic Missiles	90

CHAPTER 6

Satellite Launches in the PRC: Loral

CHAPTER SUMMARY	96
INTELSAT 708 LAUNCH FAILURE: LORAL INVESTIGATION PROVIDES PRC WITH SENSITIVE INFORMATION: OVERVIEW OF EVENTS	100
The PRC’s Launch Failure Investigation	107
The Asia Pacific Telecommunications Insurance Meeting	107
The PRC’s Creation of an ‘Independent Review Committee’	108
The Independent Review Committee’s Meetings	109
The Independent Review Committee’s Report	110



Substance of the Preliminary Report 110

The Report Goes to the PRC 112

Defense Department Analyst Discovers the Activities
of the Independent Review Committee 113

Loral and Hughes Investigate the Matter 114

The Aftermath: China Great Wall Industry Corporation Revises Its
Findings on the Cause of the Accident 114

U.S. Government Assessments of the Independent Review
Committee’s Report, and Referral to the Department of Justice 115

**DETAILS OF THE FAILED LONG MARCH 3B-INTELSAT 708 LAUNCH
AND INDEPENDENT REVIEW COMMITTEE ACTIVITIES** 116

Background on Intelsat and Loral 116

Intelsat 116

Loral Space and Communications 117

Space Systems/Loral 118

Intelsat 708 Launch Program 118

The Intelsat 708 Launch Failure 119

Events Leading Up to the Creation of the Independent Review Committee 121

The Government Security Committee Meeting at Loral 124

The Apstar 1A Insurance Meeting 128

The April 1996 Independent Review Committee Meetings in Palo Alto 129

Meeting on April 22, 1996 129

Meeting on April 23, 1996 131

Meeting on April 24, 1996 132

United States Trade Representative Meeting on April 23, 1996 132

The April and May 1996 Independent Review Committee Meetings in Beijing 134

Meeting on April 30, 1996 134

Members’ Caucus at the China World Hotel 134

Meeting on May 1, 1996 138

The Independent Review Committee Preliminary Report 140

Writing the Report 140

Loral Sends the Draft Report to the PRC 140

The Contents of the Draft Report 141



<i>Notification to Loral Officials That a Report Had Been Prepared</i>	142
<i>Loral Review and Analysis of the Independent Review Committee Report</i>	143
The Final Preliminary Report is Sent to the PRC	144
<i>Another Copy of the Report is Sent to Beijing</i>	145
Loral Management Actions After Delivery of the Report to the PRC	146
Defense Department Official Discovers the Activities	
of the Independent Review Committee	147
<i>Meeting with the Defense Technology Security Administration</i>	148
<i>Meeting with the State Department</i>	148
<i>Reynard's Telephone Call to Loral</i>	149
Loral Management Discovers the Independent Review Committee	
Report Has Been Sent to the PRC	150
Loral's 'Voluntary' Disclosure	151
<i>Investigation by Loral's Outside Counsel</i>	151
<i>Loral Submits Its 'Voluntary' Disclosure to the State Department</i>	151
The PRC Gives Its Final Failure Investigation Report	157
Assessments By U.S. Government Agencies and Referral to the Department of Justice ..	158
<i>Defense Department 1996 Assessment</i>	158
<i>Central Intelligence Agency Assessment</i>	159
<i>Department of State Assessment</i>	159
<i>Defense Technology Security Administration 1997 Assessment</i>	159
<i>Interagency Review Team Assessment</i>	160
Outline of What Was Transferred to the PRC	161
<i>Independent Review Committee Meeting Minutes</i>	161
<i>Independent Review Committee Preliminary Report</i>	162
Loral's Inaccurate Instructions on Releasing Public Domain Information to Foreigners ..	162
<i>Instructions to the Independent Review Committee</i>	
<i>Regarding Public Domain Information</i>	162
<i>State Department Views on Public Domain Information</i>	164
The Defense Department Concludes That the Independent Review Committee's	
Work Is Likely to Lead to the Improved Reliability of PRC Ballistic Missiles	164
The Cross-Fertilization of the PRC's Rocket and Missile Design Programs	166
The Independent Review Committee Aided the PRC in Identifying the Cause	
of the Long March 3B Failure	167



The PRC Implemented All of the Independent Review Committee’s Recommendations . 168
The Independent Review Committee Helped the PRC Improve the Reliability
of Its Long March Rockets 171

**AFTERWORD: U.S. COMPANIES’ MOTIVATIONS
TO LAUNCH SATELLITES IN THE PRC 172**

CHRONOLOGY OF KEY EVENTS 176

**TECHNICAL AFTERWORD: Technical Aspects of Technology Transfer
During the Loral Failure Investigation: Background 194**

CHAPTER 7

Protecting Sensitive Information at PRC Launch Sites

CHAPTER SUMMARY 218

**PROTECTING SENSITIVE INFORMATION AT PRC
LAUNCH SITES: BACKGROUND 220**
U.S.-PRC Bilateral Agreement 220
Export Licenses for PRC Launching of U.S. Satellites 220
Defense Department Monitors 222

**UNAUTHORIZED ACCESS ALLOWS OPPORTUNITIES TO GAIN
INFORMATION CONCERNING U.S. SATELLITES AND
OTHER CONTROLLED TECHNOLOGY 222**

INADEQUACY OF CURRENT SAFEGUARDS 227

**SAFEGUARDING U.S.-BUILT SATELLITES AND U.S. ROCKET
TECHNOLOGY AT PRC LAUNCHES 237**
Country-to-Country Agreements 237
Export Licenses 237



THE DEFENSE DEPARTMENT'S RESPONSIBILITIES FOR SAFEGUARDING U.S. TECHNOLOGY AT LAUNCHES	238
DEFICIENCIES OBSERVED IN THE CURRENT SYSTEM	239
U.S.-PRC Technical Discussions Occur Prior to the Issuance of Export Licenses	239
Technology Transfer Control Plans and Security Plans Vary Throughout the Space Industry	239
Temporary Assignments of Defense Department Monitors Disrupt Continuity of Launch Site Security	240
An Inadequate Number of Defense Department Monitors Is Assigned to PRC Launches	242
Uneven Prior Technical Experience of the Defense Department Monitors	244
Inadequate Headquarters Review of Monitor Reports	245
Lack of Headquarters' Support	246
Lack of Intermediate Sanction Authority	247
Conflicting Industry Priorities	249
Satellite Manufacturers, Not the Defense Department, Supervise Site Security Personnel	250
Reliance on Private Contractor Security Is Inadequate	250
Insufficient Numbers of Security Guards at PRC Launch Sites	252
CORRECTING SECURITY DEFICIENCIES	253
The 1999 Defense Authorization Act	254
EXCERPTS FROM DEFENSE DEPARTMENT MONITORS' REPORTS OF SECURITY LAUNCHES OF U.S. SATELLITES	255



CHAPTER 8

The Role of Commercial Space Insurance in Technology Transfer to the PRC

CHAPTER SUMMARY	268
THE ROLE OF COMMERCIAL SPACE INSURANCE IN TECHNOLOGY TRANSFER TO THE PRC	270
Insurance Aspects of the Long March 3B-Loral-Intelsat 708 Failure	270
The Formation of the Independent Review Committee	276
The April 15-16, 1996 Insurance Meeting in Beijing	289
The Space Insurance Industry’s Involvement in the Release of the Independent Review Committee’s Interim Report	292
CHRONOLOGY OF KEY EVENTS	298
TECHNICAL AFTERWORD: The Commercial Space Insurance Industry	300
NOTES	312





